

NOTICE OF MEETING



CITY OF BRANSON

HUMAN RESOURCES COMMITTEE

Committee Meeting – January 15, 2016 – 10:30 a.m.
Municipal Courtroom – Branson City Hall – 110 W. Maddux

AGENDA

- 1) Call to Order.
- 2) Roll Call.
- 3) Acknowledgment of December 11, 2015 Minutes.
- 4) Discussion of Previous Human Resources Committee Items.
- 5) Discussion of 2015 Turnover Data. [5-Year Turnover]
- 6) Discussion of the Health, Life and Dental Insurance Broker Bid process.
[Selection Criteria Final]
- 7) Human Resources Director's Report.
- 8) Adjourn.

Where Values are the Difference

JANUARY: VISION

Planning for the future and encouraging growth.

For more information please visit www.bransonmo.gov or contact:
Lisa Westfall, City Clerk, 417-337-8522

Posted: January 13, 2016

At: _____ By: _____

Page 1 of 1

MINUTES

HUMAN RESOURCES COMMITTEE

CITY OF BRANSON, MISSOURI

December 11, 2015

1) Call to Order

The Human Resources Committee met in the Municipal Court Room of City Hall, Friday, December 11, 2015 at 10:30 a.m. The meeting was called to order by Mayor Karen Best.

2) Roll Call

Committee Members present were Mayor Karen Best, Alderman Bob Simmons, Alderman Rick Todd, and Dr. Doug Hayter.

Also present: Jan Fischer, Hillary Bargman, Lisa Westfall, Gina Stech, Jason Reinsch, Harold Clements, Scott Wightman, Chad Forster, Cheryl Ford, Keith Francis, and Kimberly Cooper.

3) Acknowledgement November 13, 2015 minutes.

The minutes of the November 13, 2015 meeting were acknowledged on a motion by Rick Todd, seconded by Bob Simmons. Motion approved by a 4 to 0 count.

4) Discussion of previous Human Resource Committee items.

HR Director, Jan Fischer updated the Committee on previous topics that have been discussed during the HR Committee Meetings.

5) Presentation/Discussion of Risk Management Framework.

Scott Wightman presented from Arthur J. Gallagher Insurance presented the Risk Management Framework that he has been working with the Human Resources Department in developing. After the presentation the committee members asked questions. No action was taken as it was meant to inform the committee on the progress that has been made in the development stages of the program.

6) Discussion of Employee Surveys.

Jan Fischer reported on the results of the last two employee surveys. The committee discussed their thoughts of the results and asked Jan to bring comparisons from previous year's surveys.

7) Discussion of Paid Time Off Policy.

Jan Fischer presented the rough draft of a Paid Time Off Policy that he has been developing with employee input. The Committee gave suggestions on how to improve the policy.

8) Discussion of the Health, Life, and Dental Insurance Broker Bid process.

Jan Fischer presented a rough draft of the matrix the Human Resources Department plans on using to evaluate the Broker's responses to the bid that would go out for the City's Health, Life, and Dental Insurance. The Committee gave their suggestions on how to improve the matrix.

9) Human Resources Director's Report.

Jan Fischer introduced Gina Stech to the Committee as the new Human Resources Assistant. Dr. Doug Hayter suggested that the committee select someone to replace him on the Committee as his schedule would be difficult to arrange with his new position he has taken. The Committee discussed moving the next January meeting back one week and make it January 15th instead of the normally scheduled meeting of January 8th.

12) Adjourn.

A motion to Adjourn was made by Rick Todd, seconded by Bob Simmons. Motion approved by a 4 to 0 count.

PREVIOUS ITEMS DISCUSSED AT HUMAN RESOURCES COMMITTEE

- 1) Update on Succession Planning Process.
- 2) Discussion on Conducting a Salary Survey and Employee Compensation Plan.
- 3) Discussion of Risk Management Framework.
- 4) Discussion of Paid Time Off Policy.

2011-2015 Turnover by Dept.

	Five Year Average Turnover %	2015			2014			2013			2012			2011		
		FTE	EEs Separated	Turnover %	FTE	EEs Separated	Turnover %	FTE	EEs Separated	Turnover %	FTE	EEs Separated	Turnover %	FTE	EEs Separated	Turnover %
Large Departments																
Police	13.26%	61	6	9.84%	60	9	15.00%	60	6	9.84%	60	6	10.00%	60	13	21.67%
Utilities	7.20%	48	1	2.08%	48	5	10.42%	48	5	10.42%	46	5	10.87%	46	1	2.17%
Fire	6.50%	40	4	10.00%	40	3	7.50%	40	2	5.00%	40	0	0.00%	40	4	10.00%
Engineering & Public Works	3.21%	32	0	0.00%	32	1	3.13%	32	2	6.25%	30	2	6.67%	30	0	0.00%
Medium-size Departments																
Parks & Recreation	20.00%	18	4	22.22%	18	6	33.33%	18	5	27.78%	18	1	5.56%	18	2	11.11%
Planning & Development	6.35%	13	0	0.00%	13	1	7.69%	13	1	7.69%	12	1	8.33%	12	1	8.33%
Finance	11.19%	11	2	18.18%	11	2	18.18%	11	0	0.00%	9	0	0.00%	10	2	18.18%
City Clerk/Court/Legal	8.00%	10	0	0.00%	10	1	10.00%	10	1	10.00%	10	2	20.00%	10	0	0.00%
Small Departments																
Human Resources	28.57%	5	2	40.00%	4	1	25.00%	4	1	25.00%	4	2	50.00%	4	0	0.00%
Administration	13.33%	3	0	0.00%	3	0	0.00%	3	1	33.33%	3	1	33.33%	3	0	0.00%
Information Technology	26.26%	4	0	0.00%	4	0	0.00%	3	1	33.00%	4	2	50.00%	4	2	50.00%
Economic Development	33.33%	1	1	100.00%	1	0	0.00%	1	0	0.00%	1	0	0.00%	2	1	50.00%
City-wide Totals	10.07%	246	20	8.13%	244	29	11.93%	243	25	10.29%	237	22	9.28%	239	26	10.88%



MEMORANDUM

TO: Human Resources Committee Members
FROM: Jan Fischer, Human Resources Director
DATE: January 15, 2016
SUBJECT: FY 2015 City of Branson Employee Turnover

Employee Turnover:

A total of 20 full-time positions were vacated in FY 2015. Those 20 positions represented 8.13% of the City's 246 full-time positions, a decrease of 3.6%, from FY 2014. All 20 of the individuals terminating employment with the City were voluntary, none retired, and there was no involuntary terminations.

Employee Years of Service:

Employees left City of Branson employment with an average of a little more than 5 years of service. This is down from 6 years, 2 months in FY 2013. Two employees (both involuntary resignations) had less than six months of employment each which had a minor impact on the overall percentage.

Internal Promotions/Reclassifications:

In FY 2015, 55% of the City's non-entry level positions were filled by internal applicants, 11 promotions out of 20 possibilities. This is down from 83% in FY 2014. Additionally, three employees were provided advancement opportunities through position reclassifications in FY 2015.

Calculating Turnover:

Turnover is calculated based on headcount of fulltime employees leaving and being replaced. Vacant hours are not considered in this mix, nor are part-time or seasonal employees.



MEMORANDUM

TO: Human Resources Committee Members
FROM: Jan Fischer, Human Resources Director
DATE: January 15, 2016
SUBJECT: 2016 Medical Broker RFQ Results

The Human Resources Department, through the Finance Department, published a Request for Qualifications for broker services for the City's medical, dental, life and wellness plan.

Eight broker firms responded:

- Bukaty Companies, from Leawood, KS
- Ollis, Akers and Arney, from Branson, MO
- Connell Insurance, from Hollister, MO
- HMRisk, from Springfield, MO
- Arthur Gallagher and Company, from Itasca, IL
- CBIZ, from Kansas City, MO
- Mercer, from New York, NY, with Offices in Kansas City, MO
- BPJ, from Springfield, MO

Using an evaluation matrix as agreed upon by the Human Resources Committee, the Human Resources Department evaluated all eight submissions. Please see the attached spreadsheets for each firm's score.

There were four submissions that were clearly the top candidates:

- Bukaty Companies
- Ollis, Akers and Arney
- Connell Insurance
- HMRisk

The scores were within eight percentage from the first to the fourth position and will be the focus of the Committee's discussion.

	<u>Company</u>	<u>Score</u>
1.	Bukaty Companies	606
2.	Ollis Akers Arney	589
3.	Connell	571
4.	HMRisk	565
5.	Gallagher	533
6.	CBIZ	514
7.	Mercer	443
8.	BPJ	429

Selection Criteria for Medical, Dental, Vision, Life and Wellness Program Broker

CBIZ

Yes Unclear No

Non-negotiable

1. Must advance the insurance benefits renewal date to allow for adequate time for going to bid while meeting the City's internal approval process. -- New benefit year begins January 1 -- Final, accurate enrollment data transfer to payroll in December prior to new benefits -- Open enrollment completed by early November -- Final approval by Board of Aldermen in late September/early October	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
2. Must act as the City's benefits department with respect handling billing, enrollment and claims issues for medical, dental, vision and life insurances and any necessary reporting. -- Wellness Program, communication and reporting -- ACA Reporting -- COBRA and retiree benefits administration	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
3. Must provide online enrollment as the primary means for enrolling employees, tracking wellness and making changes to coverage options.	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
4. All licensure for broker service must be current and appropriate to needs.	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
5. Evidence of high quality customer service.	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
6. Must have experience with employee groups greater than 50 in size.	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
7. Must engage all employees directly to ascertain needs and to educate coverage options. -- Pre-negotiations or pre-bid employee polling and group meetings -- Post-acquisition education on benefits via group meetings	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
8. Must have sufficient liability insurance to meet City requirements.	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
9. Must disclose and mitigate conflicts of interests that could have an adverse effect on the City maintaining integrity of the broker/insurance selection process.	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
10. Must disclose all claims of adverse actions whether true or not.	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
11. Must have access to the major insurance carriers used by health care providers in the Branson area and that have plans similar to the City's current plans.	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
12. Staff that services the City of Branson must have demonstrable experience in benefits administrations, to include technology and on-line enrollment.	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>
13. Access to legal counsel for related health care legislation advice.	<u>x</u>	<u> </u>

Negotiable

	Weight 1-10		Score 0-5		Total
1. Favorable written references by clients	10	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>30</u>
2. Evidence of timely communications of new legal/legislative regulations to clients	10	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>40</u>
3. Commitment to a timeline that meets the City's desired outcomes	10	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>40</u>
4. Ability to provide the City with the required balance of coverage and price	10	x	<u> </u>	=	<u> </u>
5. Quality of online enrollment	10	x	<u> </u>	=	<u> </u>
6. Quality of Customer Service	10	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>40</u>
7. Average response time to clients	9	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>27</u>
8. Quality of Customer Service by staff members dedicated to the City	9	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>36</u>
9. Skill, experience and knowledge of staff	9	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>36</u>
10. Value added services at no cost to City	8	x	<u>5</u>	=	<u>40</u>
11. Clients per representative ratio	8	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>24</u>
12. Wellness program data migrates to medical carriers	8	x	<u>2</u>	=	<u>16</u>
13. Primary representative available to City of Branson within 4 hours of any emergency	7	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>21</u>
14. Written response time policy	7	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>21</u>
15. Length of time in the broker service industry	6	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>18</u>
16. Adverse claims against the firm	6	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>24</u>
17. Relationships made with local providers/carriers	6	x	<u>1</u>	=	<u>6</u>
18. Anticipated organizational changes that could impact service provided to the City	5	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>20</u>
19. Ability to provide timely, quality web and/or print-based communications to employees	5	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>15</u>
20. Technology available for employees for medical and wellness program at a minimum	5	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>20</u>
21. Net change in number of customer gained and lost	3	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>12</u>
22. Broker provides additional "good to know" information not required by RFQ	3	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>12</u>
23. Value added services at additional cost to City	2	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>6</u>
24. Format of Broker submission is easily evaluated against criteria by Human Resources staff	2	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>6</u>
25. Broker submission reflects all elements of the RFQ	1	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>4</u>
Grand Total					<u>514</u>

Selection Criteria for Medical, Dental, Vision, Life and Wellness Program Broker

HMRisk

Yes Unclear No

Non-negotiable

1. Must advance the insurance benefits renewal date to allow for adequate time for going to bid while meeting the City's internal approval process. -- New benefit year begins January 1 -- Final, accurate enrollment data transfer to payroll in December prior to new benefits -- Open enrollment completed by early November -- Final approval by Board of Aldermen in late September/early October	x	_____	_____
2. Must act as the City's benefits department with respect handling billing, enrollment and claims issues for medical, dental, vision and life insurances and any necessary reporting. -- Wellness Program, communication and reporting -- ACA Reporting -- COBRA and retiree benefits administration	x	_____	_____
3. Must provide online enrollment as the primary means for enrolling employees, tracking wellness and making changes to coverage options.	x	_____	_____
4. All licensure for broker service must be current and appropriate to needs.	x	_____	_____
5. Evidence of high quality customer service.	x	_____	_____
6. Must have experience with employee groups greater than 50 in size.	x	_____	_____
7. Must engage all employees directly to ascertain needs and to educate coverage options. -- Pre-negotiations or pre-bid employee polling and group meetings -- Post-acquisition education on benefits via group meetings	x	_____	_____
8. Must have sufficient liability insurance to meet City requirements.	x	_____	_____
9. Must disclose and mitigate conflicts of interests that could have an adverse effect on the City maintaining integrity of the broker/insurance selection process.	x	_____	_____
10. Must disclose all claims of adverse actions whether true or not.	x	_____	_____
11. Must have access to the major insurance carriers used by health care providers in the Branson area and that have plans similar to the City's current plans.	x	_____	_____
12. Staff that services the City of Branson must have demonstrable experience in benefits administrations, to include technology and on-line enrollment.	x	_____	_____
13. Access to legal counsel for related health care legislation advice.	x	_____	_____

Negotiable

	Weight 1-10		Score 0-5		Total
1. Favorable written references by clients	10	x	5	=	50
2. Evidence of timely communications of new legal/legislative regulations to clients	10	x	5	=	50
3. Commitment to a timeline that meets the City's desired outcomes	10	x	4	=	40
4. Ability to provide the City with the required balance of coverage and price	10	x	_____	=	_____
5. Quality of online enrollment	10	x	_____	=	_____
6. Quality of Customer Service	10	x	4	=	40
7. Average response time to clients	9	x	4	=	36
8. Quality of Customer Service by staff members dedicated to the City	9	x	4	=	36
9. Skill, experience and knowledge of staff	9	x	4	=	36
10. Value added services at no cost to City	8	x	4	=	32
11. Clients per representative ratio	8	x	3	=	24
12. Wellness program data migrates to medical carriers	8	x	3	=	24
13. Primary representative available to City of Branson within 4 hours of any emergency	7	x	4	=	28
14. Written response time policy	7	x	4	=	28
15. Length of time in the broker service industry	6	x	3	=	18
16. Adverse claims against the firm	6	x	5	=	30
17. Relationships made with local providers/carriers	6	x	3	=	18
18. Anticipated organizational changes that could impact service provided to the City	5	x	3	=	15
19. Ability to provide timely, quality web and/or print-based communications to employees	5	x	3	=	15
20. Technology available for employees for medical and wellness program at a minimum	5	x	2	=	10
21. Net change in number of customer gained and lost	3	x	4	=	12
22. Broker provides additional "good to know" information not required by RFQ	3	x	3	=	9
23. Value added services at additional cost to City	2	x	2	=	4
24. Format of Broker submission is easily evaluated against criteria by Human Resources staff	2	x	3	=	6
25. Broker submission reflects all elements of the RFQ	1	x	4	=	4
Grand Total					<u>565</u>

Selection Criteria for Medical, Dental, Vision, Life and Wellness Program Broker

Ollis Akers Arney

Yes Unclear No

Non-negotiable

1. Must advance the insurance benefits renewal date to allow for adequate time for going to bid while meeting the City's internal approval process. -- New benefit year begins January 1 -- Final, accurate enrollment data transfer to payroll in December prior to new benefits -- Open enrollment completed by early November -- Final approval by Board of Aldermen in late September/early October	x	_____	_____
2. Must act as the City's benefits department with respect handling billing, enrollment and claims issues for medical, dental, vision and life insurances and any necessary reporting. -- Wellness Program, communication and reporting -- ACA Reporting -- COBRA and retiree benefits administration	x	_____	_____
3. Must provide online enrollment as the primary means for enrolling employees, tracking wellness and making changes to coverage options.	x	_____	_____
4. All licensure for broker service must be current and appropriate to needs.	x	_____	_____
5. Evidence of high quality customer service.	x	_____	_____
6. Must have experience with employee groups greater than 50 in size.	x	_____	_____
7. Must engage all employees directly to ascertain needs and to educate coverage options. -- Pre-negotiations or pre-bid employee polling and group meetings -- Post-acquisition education on benefits via group meetings	x	_____	_____
8. Must have sufficient liability insurance to meet City requirements.	x	_____	_____
9. Must disclose and mitigate conflicts of interests that could have an adverse effect on the City maintaining integrity of the broker/insurance selection process.	x	_____	_____
10. Must disclose all claims of adverse actions whether true or not.	x	_____	_____
11. Must have access to the major insurance carriers used by health care providers in the Branson area and that have plans similar to the City's current plans.	x	_____	_____
12. Staff that services the City of Branson must have demonstrable experience in benefits administrations, to include technology and on-line enrollment.	x	_____	_____
13. Access to legal counsel for related health care legislation advice.	x	_____	_____

Negotiable

	Weight 1-10		Score 0-5		Total
1. Favorable written references by clients	10	x	5	=	50
2. Evidence of timely communications of new legal/legislative regulations to clients	10	x	4	=	40
3. Commitment to a timeline that meets the City's desired outcomes	10	x	4	=	40
4. Ability to provide the City with the required balance of coverage and price	10	x	_____	=	_____
5. Quality of online enrollment	10	x	_____	=	_____
6. Quality of Customer Service	10	x	4	=	40
7. Average response time to clients	9	x	4	=	36
8. Quality of Customer Service by staff members dedicated to the City	9	x	4	=	36
9. Skill, experience and knowledge of staff	9	x	4	=	36
10. Value added services at no cost to City	8	x	4	=	32
11. Clients per representative ratio	8	x	2	=	16
12. Wellness program data migrates to medical carriers	8	x	4	=	32
13. Primary representative available to City of Branson within 4 hours of any emergency	7	x	5	=	35
14. Written response time policy	7	x	4	=	28
15. Length of time in the broker service industry	6	x	4	=	24
16. Adverse claims against the firm	6	x	4	=	24
17. Relationships made with local providers/carriers	6	x	5	=	30
18. Anticipated organizational changes that could impact service provided to the City	5	x	4	=	20
19. Ability to provide timely, quality web and/or print-based communications to employees	5	x	3	=	15
20. Technology available for employees for medical and wellness program at a minimum	5	x	4	=	20
21. Net change in number of customer gained and lost	3	x	2	=	6
22. Broker provides additional "good to know" information not required by RFQ	3	x	3	=	9
23. Value added services at additional cost to City	2	x	3	=	6
24. Format of Broker submission is easily evaluated against criteria by Human Resources staff	2	x	5	=	10
25. Broker submission reflects all elements of the RFQ	1	x	4	=	4
Grand Total					589

Selection Criteria for Medical, Dental, Vision, Life and Wellness Program Broker

Mercer

Non-negotiable

	Yes	Unclear	No
1. Must advance the insurance benefits renewal date to allow for adequate time for going to bid while meeting the City's internal approval process. -- New benefit year begins January 1 -- Final, accurate enrollment data transfer to payroll in December prior to new benefits -- Open enrollment completed by early November -- Final approval by Board of Aldermen in late September/early October		x	
2. Must act as the City's benefits department with respect handling billing, enrollment and claims issues for medical, dental, vision and life insurances and any necessary reporting. -- Wellness Program, communication and reporting -- ACA Reporting -- COBRA and retiree benefits administration		x	
3. Must provide online enrollment as the primary means for enrolling employees, tracking wellness and making changes to coverage options.	x		
4. All licensure for broker service must be current and appropriate to needs.	x		
5. Evidence of high quality customer service.		x	
6. Must have experience with employee groups greater than 50 in size.	x		
7. Must engage all employees directly to ascertain needs and to educate coverage options. -- Pre-negotiations or pre-bid employee polling and group meetings -- Post-acquisition education on benefits via group meetings		x	
8. Must have sufficient liability insurance to meet City requirements.	x		
9. Must disclose and mitigate conflicts of interests that could have an adverse effect on the City maintaining integrity of the broker/insurance selection process.	x		
10. Must disclose all claims of adverse actions whether true or not.		x	
11. Must have access to the major insurance carriers used by health care providers in the Branson area and that have plans similar to the City's current plans.		x	
12. Staff that services the City of Branson must have demonstrable experience in benefits administrations, to include technology and on-line enrollment.	x		
13. Access to legal counsel for related health care legislation advice.	x		

Negotiable

	Weight 1-10		Score 0-5		Total
1. Favorable written references by clients	10	x	1	=	10
2. Evidence of timely communications of new legal/legislative regulations to clients	10	x	4	=	40
3. Commitment to a timeline that meets the City's desired outcomes	10	x	1	=	10
4. Ability to provide the City with the required balance of coverage and price	10	x		=	
5. Quality of online enrollment	10	x		=	
6. Quality of Customer Service	10	x	3	=	30
7. Average response time to clients	9	x	3	=	27
8. Quality of Customer Service by staff members dedicated to the City	9	x	4	=	36
9. Skill, experience and knowledge of staff	9	x	4	=	36
10. Value added services at no cost to City	8	x	3	=	24
11. Clients per representative ratio	8	x	2	=	16
12. Wellness program data migrates to medical carriers	8	x	4	=	32
13. Primary representative available to City of Branson within 4 hours of any emergency	7	x	3	=	21
14. Written response time policy	7	x	3	=	21
15. Length of time in the broker service industry	6	x	5	=	30
16. Adverse claims against the firm	6	x	2	=	12
17. Relationships made with local providers/carriers	6	x	2	=	12
18. Anticipated organizational changes that could impact service provided to the City	5	x	3	=	15
19. Ability to provide timely, quality web and/or print-based communications to employees	5	x	3	=	15
20. Technology available for employees for medical and wellness program at a minimum	5	x	4	=	20
21. Net change in number of customer gained and lost	3	x	3	=	9
22. Broker provides additional "good to know" information not required by RFQ	3	x	4	=	12
23. Value added services at additional cost to City	2	x	4	=	8
24. Format of Broker submission is easily evaluated against criteria by Human Resources staff	2	x	2	=	4
25. Broker submission reflects all elements of the RFQ	1	x	3	=	3

Grand Total 443

Selection Criteria for Medical, Dental, Vision, Life and Wellness Program Broker

BPJ

Yes Unclear No

Non-negotiable

1. Must advance the insurance benefits renewal date to allow for adequate time for going to bid while meeting the City's internal approval process. -- New benefit year begins January 1 -- Final, accurate enrollment data transfer to payroll in December prior to new benefits -- Open enrollment completed by early November -- Final approval by Board of Aldermen in late September/early October	_____	x	_____
2. Must act as the City's benefits department with respect handling billing, enrollment and claims issues for medical, dental, vision and life insurances and any necessary reporting. -- Wellness Program, communication and reporting -- ACA Reporting -- COBRA and retiree benefits administration	x	_____	_____
3. Must provide online enrollment as the primary means for enrolling employees, tracking wellness and making changes to coverage options.	x	_____	_____
4. All licensure for broker service must be current and appropriate to needs.	_____	x	_____
5. Evidence of high quality customer service.	x	_____	_____
6. Must have experience with employee groups greater than 50 in size.	_____	x	_____
7. Must engage all employees directly to ascertain needs and to educate coverage options. -- Pre-negotiations or pre-bid employee polling and group meetings -- Post-acquisition education on benefits via group meetings	_____	x	_____
8. Must have sufficient liability insurance to meet City requirements.	_____	x	_____
9. Must disclose and mitigate conflicts of interests that could have an adverse effect on the City maintaining integrity of the broker/insurance selection process.	x	_____	_____
10. Must disclose all claims of adverse actions whether true or not.	_____	x	_____
11. Must have access to the major insurance carriers used by health care providers in the Branson area and that have plans similar to the City's current plans.	x	_____	_____
12. Staff that services the City of Branson must have demonstrable experience in benefits administrations, to include technology and on-line enrollment.	x	_____	_____
13. Access to legal counsel for related health care legislation advice.	x	_____	_____

Negotiable

	Weight 1-10		Score 0-5	Total
1. Favorable written references by clients	10	x	1	= 10
2. Evidence of timely communications of new legal/legislative regulations to clients	10	x	1	= 10
3. Commitment to a timeline that meets the City's desired outcomes	10	x	3	= 30
4. Ability to provide the City with the required balance of coverage and price	10	x	_____	= _____
5. Quality of online enrollment	10	x	_____	= _____
6. Quality of Customer Service	10	x	2	= 20
7. Average response time to clients	9	x	4	= 36
8. Quality of Customer Service by staff members dedicated to the City	9	x	4	= 36
9. Skill, experience and knowledge of staff	9	x	3	= 27
10. Value added services at no cost to City	8	x	1	= 8
11. Clients per representative ratio	8	x	2	= 16
12. Wellness program data migrates to medical carriers	8	x	2	= 16
13. Primary representative available to City of Branson within 4 hours of any emergency	7	x	4	= 28
14. Written response time policy	7	x	4	= 28
15. Length of time in the broker service industry	6	x	5	= 30
16. Adverse claims against the firm	6	x	5	= 30
17. Relationships made with local providers/carriers	6	x	4	= 24
18. Anticipated organizational changes that could impact service provided to the City	5	x	3	= 15
19. Ability to provide timely, quality web and/or print-based communications to employees	5	x	3	= 15
20. Technology available for employees for medical and wellness program at a minimum	5	x	3	= 15
21. Net change in number of customer gained and lost	3	x	2	= 6
22. Broker provides additional "good to know" information not required by RFQ	3	x	3	= 9
23. Value added services at additional cost to City	2	x	4	= 8
24. Format of Broker submission is easily evaluated against criteria by Human Resources staff	2	x	5	= 10
25. Broker submission reflects all elements of the RFQ	1	x	2	= 2
Grand Total				<u>429</u>

Selection Criteria for Medical, Dental, Vision, Life and Wellness Program Broker

Connell

Non-negotiable

Yes Unclear No

1. Must advance the insurance benefits renewal date to allow for adequate time for going to bid while meeting the City's internal approval process. -- New benefit year begins January 1 -- Final, accurate enrollment data transfer to payroll in December prior to new benefits -- Open enrollment completed by early November -- Final approval by Board of Aldermen in late September/early October	_____	x	_____
2. Must act as the City's benefits department with respect handling billing, enrollment and claims issues for medical, dental, vision and life insurances and any necessary reporting. -- Wellness Program, communication and reporting -- ACA Reporting -- COBRA and retiree benefits administration	_____	x	_____
3. Must provide online enrollment as the primary means for enrolling employees, tracking wellness and making changes to coverage options.	x		_____
4. All licensure for broker service must be current and appropriate to needs.	x		_____
5. Evidence of high quality customer service.	x		_____
6. Must have experience with employee groups greater than 50 in size.	x		_____
7. Must engage all employees directly to ascertain needs and to educate coverage options. -- Pre-negotiations or pre-bid employee polling and group meetings -- Post-acquisition education on benefits via group meetings	x		_____
8. Must have sufficient liability insurance to meet City requirements.	x		_____
9. Must disclose and mitigate conflicts of interests that could have an adverse effect on the City maintaining integrity of the broker/insurance selection process.	x		_____
10. Must disclose all claims of adverse actions whether true or not.	x		_____
11. Must have access to the major insurance carriers used by health care providers in the Branson area and that have plans similar to the City's current plans.	x		_____
12. Staff that services the City of Branson must have demonstrable experience in benefits administrations, to include technology and on-line enrollment.	x		_____
13. Access to legal counsel for related health care legislation advice.	x		_____

Negotiable

Weight Score Total
1-10 0-5

1. Favorable written references by clients	10	x	5	=	50
2. Evidence of timely communications of new legal/legislative regulations to clients	10	x	4	=	40
3. Commitment to a timeline that meets the City's desired outcomes	10	x	2	=	20
4. Ability to provide the City with the required balance of coverage and price	10	x	_____	=	_____
5. Quality of online enrollment	10	x	_____	=	_____
6. Quality of Customer Service	10	x	4	=	40
7. Average response time to clients	9	x	4	=	36
8. Quality of Customer Service by staff members dedicated to the City	9	x	4	=	36
9. Skill, experience and knowledge of staff	9	x	4	=	36
10. Value added services at no cost to City	8	x	4	=	32
11. Clients per representative ratio	8	x	4	=	32
12. Wellness program data migrates to medical carriers	8	x	4	=	32
13. Primary representative available to City of Branson within 4 hours of any emergency	7	x	5	=	35
14. Written response time policy	7	x	3	=	21
15. Length of time in the broker service industry	6	x	4	=	24
16. Adverse claims against the firm	6	x	5	=	30
17. Relationships made with local providers/carriers	6	x	5	=	30
18. Anticipated organizational changes that could impact service provided to the City	5	x	4	=	20
19. Ability to provide timely, quality web and/or print-based communications to employees	5	x	3	=	15
20. Technology available for employees for medical and wellness program at a minimum	5	x	3	=	15
21. Net change in number of customer gained and lost	3	x	3	=	9
22. Broker provides additional "good to know" information not required by RFQ	3	x	3	=	9
23. Value added services at additional cost to City	2	x	0	=	0
24. Format of Broker submission is easily evaluated against criteria by Human Resources staff	2	x	3	=	6
25. Broker submission reflects all elements of the RFQ	1	x	3	=	3

Grand Total 571

Selection Criteria for Medical, Dental, Vision, Life and Wellness Program Broker

Arthur Gallagher

Yes Unclear No

Non-negotiable

1. Must advance the insurance benefits renewal date to allow for adequate time for going to bid while meeting the City's internal approval process. -- New benefit year begins January 1 -- Final, accurate enrollment data transfer to payroll in December prior to new benefits -- Open enrollment completed by early November -- Final approval by Board of Aldermen in late September/early October	x	_____	_____
2. Must act as the City's benefits department with respect handling billing, enrollment and claims issues for medical, dental, vision and life insurances and any necessary reporting. -- Wellness Program, communication and reporting -- ACA Reporting -- COBRA and retiree benefits administration	x	_____	_____
3. Must provide online enrollment as the primary means for enrolling employees, tracking wellness and making changes to coverage options.	x	_____	_____
4. All licensure for broker service must be current and appropriate to needs.	x	_____	_____
5. Evidence of high quality customer service.	x	_____	_____
6. Must have experience with employee groups greater than 50 in size.	x	_____	_____
7. Must engage all employees directly to ascertain needs and to educate coverage options. -- Pre-negotiations or pre-bid employee polling and group meetings -- Post-acquisition education on benefits via group meetings	x	_____	_____
8. Must have sufficient liability insurance to meet City requirements.	x	_____	_____
9. Must disclose and mitigate conflicts of interests that could have an adverse effect on the City maintaining integrity of the broker/insurance selection process.	x	_____	_____
10. Must disclose all claims of adverse actions whether true or not.	x	_____	_____
11. Must have access to the major insurance carriers used by health care providers in the Branson area and that have plans similar to the City's current plans.	x	_____	_____
12. Staff that services the City of Branson must have demonstrable experience in benefits administrations, to include technology and on-line enrollment.	x	_____	_____
13. Access to legal counsel for related health care legislation advice.	x	_____	_____

Negotiable

	Weight 1-10		Score 0-5		Total
1. Favorable written references by clients	10	x	5	=	50
2. Evidence of timely communications of new legal/legislative regulations to clients	10	x	4	=	40
3. Commitment to a timeline that meets the City's desired outcomes	10	x	3	=	30
4. Ability to provide the City with the required balance of coverage and price	10	x	_____	=	_____
5. Quality of online enrollment	10	x	_____	=	_____
6. Quality of Customer Service	10	x	4	=	40
7. Average response time to clients	9	x	4	=	36
8. Quality of Customer Service by staff members dedicated to the City	9	x	4	=	36
9. Skill, experience and knowledge of staff	9	x	4	=	36
10. Value added services at no cost to City	8	x	3	=	24
11. Clients per representative ratio	8	x	2	=	16
12. Wellness program data migrates to medical carriers	8	x	2	=	16
13. Primary representative available to City of Branson within 4 hours of any emergency	7	x	3	=	21
14. Written response time policy	7	x	3	=	21
15. Length of time in the broker service industry	6	x	5	=	30
16. Adverse claims against the firm	6	x	4	=	24
17. Relationships made with local providers/carriers	6	x	4	=	24
18. Anticipated organizational changes that could impact service provided to the City	5	x	3	=	15
19. Ability to provide timely, quality web and/or print-based communications to employees	5	x	4	=	20
20. Technology available for employees for medical and wellness program at a minimum	5	x	3	=	15
21. Net change in number of customer gained and lost	3	x	2	=	6
22. Broker provides additional "good to know" information not required by RFQ	3	x	5	=	15
23. Value added services at additional cost to City	2	x	4	=	8
24. Format of Broker submission is easily evaluated against criteria by Human Resources staff	2	x	3	=	6
25. Broker submission reflects all elements of the RFQ	1	x	4	=	4
Grand Total					533

Selection Criteria for Medical, Dental, Vision, Life and Wellness Program Broker

Bukaty Companies

Non-negotiable

	Yes	Unclear	No
1. Must advance the insurance benefits renewal date to allow for adequate time for going to bid while meeting the City's internal approval process. -- New benefit year begins January 1 -- Final, accurate enrollment data transfer to payroll in December prior to new benefits -- Open enrollment completed by early November -- Final approval by Board of Aldermen in late September/early October	<u>x</u>		
2. Must act as the City's benefits department with respect handling billing, enrollment and claims issues for medical, dental, vision and life insurances and any necessary reporting. -- Wellness Program, communication and reporting -- ACA Reporting -- COBRA and retiree benefits administration	<u>x</u>		
3. Must provide online enrollment as the primary means for enrolling employees, tracking wellness and making changes to coverage options.	<u>x</u>		
4. All licensure for broker service must be current and appropriate to needs.	<u>x</u>		
5. Evidence of high quality customer service.	<u>x</u>		
6. Must have experience with employee groups greater than 50 in size.	<u>x</u>		
7. Must engage all employees directly to ascertain needs and to educate coverage options. -- Pre-negotiations or pre-bid employee polling and group meetings -- Post-acquisition education on benefits via group meetings	<u>x</u>		
8. Must have sufficient liability insurance to meet City requirements.	<u>x</u>		
9. Must disclose and mitigate conflicts of interests that could have an adverse effect on the City maintaining integrity of the broker/insurance selection process.	<u>x</u>		
10. Must disclose all claims of adverse actions whether true or not.	<u>x</u>		
11. Must have access to the major insurance carriers used by health care providers in the Branson area and that have plans similar to the City's current plans.	<u>x</u>		
12. Staff that services the City of Branson must have demonstrable experience in benefits administrations, to include technology and on-line enrollment.	<u>x</u>		
13. Access to legal counsel for related health care legislation advice.	<u>x</u>		

Negotiable

	Weight 1-10		Score 0-5		Total
1. Favorable written references by clients	10	x	<u>5</u>	=	<u>50</u>
2. Evidence of timely communications of new legal/legislative regulations to clients	10	x	<u>5</u>	=	<u>50</u>
3. Commitment to a timeline that meets the City's desired outcomes	10	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>40</u>
4. Ability to provide the City with the required balance of coverage and price	10	x	<u> </u>	=	<u> </u>
5. Quality of online enrollment	10	x	<u> </u>	=	<u> </u>
6. Quality of Customer Service	10	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>40</u>
7. Average response time to clients	9	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>36</u>
8. Quality of Customer Service by staff members dedicated to the City	9	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>36</u>
9. Skill, experience and knowledge of staff	9	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>36</u>
10. Value added services at no cost to City	8	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>32</u>
11. Clients per representative ratio	8	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>32</u>
12. Wellness program data migrates to medical carriers	8	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>32</u>
13. Primary representative available to City of Branson within 4 hours of any emergency	7	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>28</u>
14. Written response time policy	7	x	<u>5</u>	=	<u>35</u>
15. Length of time in the broker service industry	6	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>18</u>
16. Adverse claims against the firm	6	x	<u>5</u>	=	<u>30</u>
17. Relationships made with local providers/carriers	6	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>18</u>
18. Anticipated organizational changes that could impact service provided to the City	5	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>15</u>
19. Ability to provide timely, quality web and/or print-based communications to employees	5	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>15</u>
20. Technology available for employees for medical and wellness program at a minimum	5	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>20</u>
21. Net change in number of customer gained and lost	3	x	<u>3</u>	=	<u>9</u>
22. Broker provides additional "good to know" information not required by RFQ	3	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>12</u>
23. Value added services at additional cost to City	2	x	<u>5</u>	=	<u>10</u>
24. Format of Broker submission is easily evaluated against criteria by Human Resources staff	2	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>8</u>
25. Broker submission reflects all elements of the RFQ	1	x	<u>4</u>	=	<u>4</u>

Grand Total 606